



# OFFICE OF THE CLERK/TREASURER

City of Burlington

City Hall, Room 20, 149 Church Street, Burlington, VT 05401

Voice (802) 865-7000

Fax (802) 865-7014

TTY (802) 865-7142

## REDISTRICTING COMMITTEE

Tuesday, June 4, 2013

### MINUTES

**PRESENT:** Sharon Bushor, Ward 1 City Councilors; Jim Langan, Ward 1 Representative; Lluvia Mulvaney-Stanak, Japhet Els, Ward 2 Representatives; Rachel Siegel, Ward 3 City Councilor; Nancy Greenwalt, Ward 3 Representative; Jim Holway, George Gamache, Ward 4 Representatives; Joan Shannon, Ward 5 City Councilor; Elisa Nelson, Ward 5 Representative; Andy Montroll, Michael Rooney, Ward 6 Representatives; Paul Decelles, Ward 7 City Councilor; Jason L'Ecuyer, Ward 7 Representative

**ALSO PRESENT:** Cindy Cook, Facilitator; Assistant City Attorney Gene Bergman; Jay Appleton, Planning and Zoning; Tom Ayres, Ward 4 City Councilor; Karen Paul, Ward 6 City Councilor, Lea Terhune, Ward 4 Alternate; Bill Keogh, Ward 5 Alternate; Mannie Lionni, Ward 7 Alternate; Barry Trutor, Mark Barlow, Tiki Archembeau, Robert Bristow-Johnson, Emma Mulvaney-Stanak

#### 1. Agenda (5 min)

Jim Holway, Ward 4 Representative, requested they pluralize the 4 ward plan because there is more than one option.

#### 2. Ward Map Decision: To be made by committee (10 min)

Japhet Els, Ward 2 Representative, stated at the end of the last meeting they took a straw poll of members who were interested in a four ward plan. Several members expressed interest. There were then concerns about how that decision was made. They decided to have the committee vote on whether to include the four ward plan to ensure that everyone is happy with how they made the decision.

Joan Shannon, City Council President, suggested that they allow for discussion of any other plan that people may have as a part of item 5. Mr. Holway stated he is in favor of doing that.

The Committee agreed to allow discussion of the 4 ward plans and any other plans.

#### 3. Review and approve May 14 and May 29 Meeting Minutes (5 min)

The Committee agreed to address the minutes at the end of the meeting.

#### 4. Public Forum (10 min)

Robert Bristow-Johnson, Ward 7 Resident, spoke about equity in redistricting and in favor of a plan with

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

equal sized wards with equal numbers of Councilors. He stated he created a map that creates the least change for people.

Tom Ayres, Ward 4 City Councilor, suggested considering a 7 ward 14 councilor model. He spoke in favor of having an equal number of wards with an equal number of councilors. He stated none of the current plans make people happy.

## **5. Discuss Newly Adjusted Plans: (30 min)**

### **a. 8 Ward Plan Modified to Reduce Impacts to Existing Wards**

George Gamache, Ward 4 Representative, stated he has worked to minimize the impact to existing wards. He outlined the changes that he made from the previous version. The problems arise in the current Ward 1 where they have had the most growth. He has left that ward larger to allow those who live there to divide it into two wards the best way possible. Other than that area, the existing wards are very similar.

Mr. Els inquired if they should consider Ward 1/8 to be two wards. Mr. Gamache stated that was his intention, but felt it would be better for people who live there to make that decision.

Sharon Bushor, Ward 1 City Councilor, stated this plan does not solve a problem, it just leaves it on the map. They need to actually create an eighth ward. This plan also adds more UVM housing into Ward 1. She feels this plan will divide her ward in half and that it does not solve the problem.

Mr. Holway stated at the last meeting, people felt like they were being told how to divide the wards. The idea is not to leave a problem on the table, but to respect people and include them in decision making.

Jim Langan, Ward 1 Representative, stated he believes that they could create an eighth ward that would not split Ward 1. There could be a large block between Pearl, Pine, Maple, and Prospect Streets that would include some UVM dorms. It would be just under the 10% deviation, but it would leave the 8<sup>th</sup> ward with a transient population. It would also borrow from all of the wards.

Mr. Els stated that the Ward 1/8 is the same as Ward 1 in the 4 ward map. He thinks it would be hard to create two wards without having a very transient population. People living there may feel they were shorted. Mr. Gamache stated it is challenging and he heard the same complaint when he presented it as two wards. Mr. Els stated having a larger ward with more residences may help people who live among a lot of students.

Paul Decelles, Ward 7 City Councilor, stated all of the variations are pretty close. He understands the concerns, but it does not appear that different than Ward 1 in any other version.

Councilor Bushor indicated which neighborhoods in Ward 1 are stable. UVM has grown and it is part of Burlington, not just Ward 1. There are core people who identify with the ward and the polling place. The intent was to choose something with the least impact, which this does not do. She would be willing to consider this eight ward model, but sees this as seven wards as it stands.

Mr. Holway stated that living in a ward with a lot of transient students is not problematic. That will allow people to run for Council more easily because there will be a lower number of active constituents. He noted when they are looking for representatives, they look for someone like minded. If he were in a ward with a

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

mix of college students and not students, he would want someone who lives in that area. Leaving it undefined was meant to be an olive branch to Ward 1. It is unclear what the goal is. Some think that having the least impact is a goal, but that is lofty. However, they will have to change.

Andy Montroll, Ward 6 Representative, stated it will be challenging to break up the Ward 1/8 in the proposal. One ward would have to be student heavy and it would be difficult to find people to run. The 8 ward map is very similar to the 4 ward map. The 4 ward map left Ward 1 intact and added several thousand students. Dividing it further would be difficult.

Mr. Els stated this geographic location has been a touch point for many conversations. He does not believe they will be able to solve the problem. Living in a ward with a lot of students would short someone. They have talked about neighborhoods and keeping them together. If a neighborhood has less actual people who live there year round and go to the polls, issues that impact that neighborhood will not receive as much attention at the polls. There is also the logistical problem of finding people to run. He believes that having a large student ward would be challenging. The only solution he sees is to include larger residences, which the 4 ward plan does, to balance out the transient population. They have to admit the reality that students are not as active community members as residents.

Elisa Nelson, Ward 5 Representative, stated she appreciates that Ward 3 is better respected in this model. Without dividing lines in Ward 1, it is an incomplete plan, though she appreciates the thought process. She is unable to make a decision without that line being drawn.

City Council President Shannon requested that no one speak twice until everyone else has spoken. She inquired if they will vote at the end of each discussion or at the end. Ms. Cook stated they can address that as part of item 7.

Mr. Gamache stated there are only marginal differences in Ward 1 in all of the plans. It is a challenging area of the City. It is the same in the 4 and 8 ward models, and only slightly smaller in the 6 ward model. Every plan is trying to deal with those challenges.

Michael Rooney, Ward 6, stated there is nothing they can do about the students living in Ward 1. There will be a lot of students. He sees that as an advantage for residents and those campaigning because students won't vote.

Councilor Siegel stated she does not feel great about this plan overall. It has taken into consideration a lot of their comments. Wards 2 and 3 are better than before because they are closer to how they used to be. Mr. Langan stated it may be easier to use this as a 12 councilor model so that Ward 8 would only have to field one councilor or school board candidate.

City Council President Shannon suggested they add number of legislative district and ward combinations to the list. There are times when people get the wrong ballot because there are so many combinations. As they increase the number of wards overlapping legislative districts, they are increasing the number of ballots. This plan increases that problem.

Mr. Holway stated they have tried to be sensitive to neighborhoods. It is compact, uses existing geographic boundaries, minimizes change to wards, and keeps the Old and New North Ends intact. There are advantages to a larger number of wards. When they use large wards, there are problems with diversity. They

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

need to stop talking about UVM students as if they are different people. They may live differently, but they are people. There are a large percentage of students that live on the hill, but there are students in each ward. That is important when considering each plan.

Councilor Decelles stated that Ward/District combinations should not be a deciding factor at all. There are people in the City Attorney's Office and the City Clerk's Office who are paid to do this as their job. They do an admirable job running elections, though there are sometimes mistakes. The Committee should not be selling the fact that it will be easier for City Staff to the voters. Jay Appleton, Planning and Zoning, stated that it not only affects ballots but also management of the voter checklist. The HAVA system is maintained by the State and is very archaic. There are over 60,000 people on the voter checklist for Burlington and they cannot be removed, only made inactive. Their ward is listed as well as their district. When they redistricted at the State level, they added an additional district. It required a ton of staff time to get the database right. They State said they would do it, but many records were not done. They had to go through it line by line. Increasing the number of wards will pose significant challenges to management of the voter checklist as well as balloting. Councilor Decelles stated that perspective is helpful, but he hopes the committee does not weigh their decision based on one employee's perspective. Assistant City Attorney Bergman stated it also places a burden on volunteer election workers. Ward Clerks, Inspectors of Elections and AEOs do this work and receive only meager compensation.

Mr. Montroll stated he appreciates the comments about the students. The challenge is not with the students but with the dorms. Students who live in dorms are first and second year students who are ineligible to serve a complete term. They are not allowed to stay in the dorms in the summer. After their second year, most students do not live in the dorms. There are students who live near dorms.

#### **b. 4 Ward Plans\* (as necessitated by #2)**

City Council President Shannon stated this is her preference but it does not seem to be the preference of others. It also does not seem to satisfy the New North End, though she felt it would. There were comments that the 13 councilor plan would require a councilor to represent 10,000 people when everyone else would have to represent 5,000. This is the best way to create a level playing field so that everyone works in the same sized ward. The map was developed with the intention of keeping the NPAs intact. It is divided along major boundaries. The major difference is that they combine Wards 5 and 6 and they move more dorms into Ward 1. Ward 3 uses Main Street as a more clean divider. Wards 2 and 3 are combined and the Buell/Bradley neighborhood is moved to Ward 1. Lakeview Terrace becomes part of Ward 2. Mr. Montroll stated many of the dorms in Ward 6 have been moved to Ward 1. Since they are keeping the general population in Ward 1, it seems that it would be okay to add more students. City Council President Shannon stated it is also best when you consider the size of the Council. She has not heard anyone saying they should enlarge the Council and many feel it should be smaller. A little smaller would be more functional and they do not want to become a legislature.

Councilor Bushor stated she is not excited about this because of the size of the Council and the energy it would take to run. She feels that she could support this if they could find a way to address diversity. This does respect neighborhoods that currently have a lot in common.

Mr. Holway stated it is inaccurate to say that this does not satisfy the New North End. The problems of diversity are very real. When the herd of who can afford or have time to work in big wards is thinned, there are certain classes of people who will not have the needed resources. There are people who feel that they

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

should have a larger Council. The math is right having 8 wards, but having 4 wards and 16 councilors would be his second choice. It is fair and balanced. Management of the City Council is not a criteria for redistricting. It is about representation. Having four people per large ward, pockets of that ward will find their own candidates. This will allow for diversity. It may be possible to win election with the support of a pocket of voters. He is sympathetic to the efficiency of how government works.

Jason L'Ecuyer, Ward 7 Representative, stated the map is good. Wards 4 and 7 look good as do Wards 2 and 3. It respects what they have been trying to do to have equal representation in different quadrants. It treats the New North End fairly. More Councilors means more representation. He supports the 8 ward 16 councilor model. The 6 ward 13 councilor model is not supported in the New North End and will be divisive at the ballot box. Having more councilors will allow for more representation and more diversity. He does have concerns that it will not allow for the feel of small town politics. He could support something like this.

Ms. Nelson stated she ran for City Council in what would have been Ward 3 in this map as a novice with \$750 against two incumbents. She did not win, but made a good showing. It is not impossible to run. She has received comments from people who think that having a slightly smaller Council would be a good thing. This would also allow for a slight increase in compensation for Councilors. Increasing the council to 16 would be cumbersome for the democratic process.

Mr. Rooney stated he sees this plan as a bandaid. Wards 5 and 6 are put together but they have very different perspectives. What is happening in Ward 5 is very different than in Ward 6. He is not sure about the issue that larger wards create less diversity and would not reject a plan on those grounds alone. He does reject the plan for the way it brings people with uncommon interests together.

Mr. Els stated this map does respect neighborhoods. It does solve part of the student issue that they have been talking about by including more residences. He has worked on campaigns nationally and locally. At a local level, money is not usually a problem. If a candidate is struggling to raise \$1,000 from people they know locally, they probably need help with basic campaigning. There have been candidates with very little money who have won and candidates with lots of money who have lost. It should not be the lynchpin in this decision. The Council is already larger than any other Council in the nation for a City this size. He does not want to focus on growing it. He has been to a number of meetings where issues are debated on and on. It would be helpful if they could come to decisions more quickly. He is in favor of including as many voices as possible, but he does see benefits of using the 4 ward 12 councilor model.

Llu Mulvaney-Stanak, Ward 2 Representative, stated she cannot support 4 wards with 12 or 16 councilors. She believes that there would be issues with financing and campaigning, particularly for third party candidates and independents. Having big parties with an infusion of cash makes for an automatic win. Councilors would have to deal with a lot more constituents and find a way to respond to many more inquiries. The democratic process comes down to leadership and good facilitation of meetings, which is not something that they can fix through ward boundaries. Councilors need to work across party lines and get work done on behalf of the City.

Mr. Montroll stated he likes that this map combines different areas of the City that are somewhat combined already. The biggest challenge will be Wards 5 and 6. They have not historically worked together, though he feels that they can. He prefers smaller wards in general, but does feel this is workable and could be fine for the City. He suggested they have separate discussions about whether the map is correct and how many councilors they would have.

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

City Council President Shannon stated Ward 5 lacks common interest with Ward 5. She does not feel that it is a problem and she loves that she represents a variety of neighborhoods. It forces a broader perspective. There has been a lot of discussion about large wards not being good for diversity. She has read that claim is more about a community in which the majority is not willing to elect minorities. She does not feel that applies to Burlington. By drawing districts, boundaries can become the majority in a district. A district boundary can be drawn so that minorities are the majority in that district. The smaller a district is, the easier it would be to draw districts in this way. In Burlington, those districts would have to be so small that it would be nearly impossible to do. She does not think that Burlington's diversity issues are related to this discussion. Ward 1 is underrepresented now and they will be making very little change. They have proved that a minority can get elected in a district that size. She does not see an infusion of money from her party and has only received a few hundred dollars.

Councilor Siegel stated she does not support this with 12 or 16 councilors. Minorities cannot get a pocket of voters unless they change the voting mechanism. With winner takes all voting, it is a no-go in her book. She has to wonder if smaller Councils have professional Councilors and how many are lawyers. The barrier to being elected as a person of color is not that people will not vote for them, it is that they may not have the resources needed to do that kind of campaigning. Most middle and upper middle class people of color live on the outskirts of Burlington while the majority are very poor. It is also not just racial diversity that they lose with larger wards. Small parties and independents receive \$0 when running, so even \$200 is a lot.

Mr. Holway stated diversity is the big issue in this ward. It is not just about color, but also age, wealth, race and party. Different ideas make the overall City richer.

City Council President Shannon stated she thinks they should take a more global look at the matrix. Ms. Cook stated she has tried to capture all comments and requested the Committee add any additional information they would like. Mr. Montroll stated this plan respects all NPAs except Wards 5 and 6.

### **c. Recap of 13-councilor map**

City Council President Shannon inquired if this map has changed since the last meeting. Mr. Montroll stated it has not, but he does want to make sure that it is on the table. City Council President Shannon suggested they not go through it again. She also does not always agree with what has been put on the board. Ms. Cook stated she has tried to record what has said. City Council President Shannon stated it is complex and everyone sees things differently. It does not fully capture the feelings of the group.

Councilor Bushor stated they discussed the criteria for the 6 ward 13 councilor model and she is happy not to discuss it.

Mr. Rooney stated there are two 13 councilor models, one with 6 wards and one with 7 wards.

Mr. Holway stated he wants to talk about 13 councilors. This plan creates a portion of the City with a different set of rules. He finds this problematic and will be a non-starter for the New North End. The math of a 6 or 7 ward model leaves the New North End underrepresented by 2%. There are two other wards that would have be overrepresented for a difference of 7%. They are not balanced in representation and sets of rules. That will change the dynamic of how policy is made.

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

Mr. Els stated he feels these points have already been discussed and would prefer only to hear new points.

Mr. L'Ecuyer stated the math works but the equity to the wards doesn't. Having 6 wards lumps 3 councilors together. Having 7 wards will affect voter turnout in the small ward in off years.

Councilor Siegel stated she is uncomfortable with adding another map at this point. She would like to discuss the three maps and figure out which has the most support. They can then fine tune the map with the most support.

Councilor Bushor stated there was an attachment on the table with four maps. She would like to entertain addressing all four. One was a second 8 ward scenario. The first 8 ward scenario is really a 7 ward scenario.

Councilor Decelles suggested they look at the new map for five minutes and have a brief discussion.

Mr. Montroll stated he is open to hearing the explanation of the new map. He has heard that there might be interest in the 7 ward 14 councilor map. There are challenges but it is available if people want to look at it.

City Council President Shannon and Councilor Decelles made a motion they allow five minutes of discussion of the new map. The motion passed.

#### **d. Alternative 8 Ward Plan**

A member of the audience, Robert Bristow-Johnson, stated he created a map that creates the least change. All of the boundaries on the extremities are the same. Lakeview Terrace has been removed from Ward 4. He considered the New North End to go to the railroad tracks. That allows for 10,206 people. He then addressed the part of the City with the most dynamic population, which is where Wards 1, 2, 3 and 6 meet. He marked out census blocks until he grew the new ward enough to make the numbers equal. The total deviation is 8.8%. The only major change is to Ward 8.

Councilor Decelles stated only Wards 1 and 6 are majorly affected.

Mr. Langan stated they can split the bit UVM dorm block to make it less dorm heavy. It is still a concern for fielding candidates.

Mr. Montroll stated there are a couple of neighborhoods in Ward 6, Robinson Parkway, Henderson Terrace, South Prospect, and Summit Street, that are isolated and not connected to the rest of the ward. The other parts of the City are respected.

Mr. Rooney stated he agrees. He still does not agree with adding more Councilors.

Mr. Gamache and Mr. Holway made a motion to discuss the 7 ward 14 councilor plan.

Mr. Holway stated at the beginning of the meeting they agreed to allow new maps on the floor. He wants to make sure they look at every map.

Mr. Montroll stated he believes they can look at them quickly and decide if they are interested in them.

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

The motion passed.

#### **e. 7 Ward 14 Councilors Plan**

Mr. Montroll stated this map roughly follows the boundaries of the existing wards. It makes adjustments in each ward to balance numbers. The biggest adjustment is between Wards 7 and 3. Ward 7 would dip down more into Ward 3. Ward 2 then expands into Ward 1.

Mr. Gamache stated the attempt was to keep deviation as low as possible and to maintain some existing wards.

Councilor Decelles stated Lakeview Terrace does not like being in Ward 7 and it is not contiguous. All this would do is make the problem worse. He feels this would be a non-starter for Wards 7, 2, and 3.

Mr. Appleton stated the existing plan takes 273 people from Lakeview Terrace and puts them in Ward 7. Now they would need between 1,100-1,200 people to complete Ward 7.

Ms. Nelson stated the idea of Ward 7 reaching almost all the way to Main Street does not respect neighborhoods or geographic boundaries.

Mr. Montroll stated this is the challenge with 7 wards and why they need to do something differently. It was worth looking at, but it has serious challenges.

Mannie Lionni, Ward 7 Alternate, stated he has lived on Lakeview Terrace for 15 years and has never had discussions with his neighbors about problems with being in Ward 7. They know where they go to vote. No one who lives there feels that they have not been represented. The City Councilors have always been available and responsive.

City Council President Shannon stated she has heard from people on Lakeview Terrace who have expressed frustration of being part of Ward 7 and used to live there. It is not fair to say that it is not frustrating to the residents. This plan does not keep the Old and New North Ends separate. Each plan has its problem, though she is not sure it is better or worse than others.

Ms. Mulvaney-Stanak inquired what the process for reporting to the City Council would be and why it would take 30 minutes. Mr. Els stated he was ball parking the number.

Ms. Mulvaney-Stanak and Mr. Gamache made a motion to move to public forum. The motion passed.

#### **6. Public Forum (10 min)**

Mr. Bristow-Johnson stated that if reduction of City Council is the goal, he would recommend a four ward 8 councilor plan. This would make big changes for the whole City and no one would be singled out. He spoke against the three year terms that a 12 councilor plan would have.

Councilor Ayres stated it seems this will come down to a choice between the 6 ward 13 councilor model and the 4 ward model. It is disingenuous for those who have spoken out against having large wards in the four ward model to support doing the same thing to wards 4 and 7. Both plans are flawed.

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

Mr. Archembeau stated four wards will disenfranchise minority voters and will favor big parties.

Lea Terhune, Ward 4 Alterante, stated there was a comment that students cannot live on campus for four years, which is not true. She noted that many people who live on Lakeview Terrace are active members of the Ward 7 NPA. She commended the maps that make little change but fit within deviation. She stated that although Burlington has a larger Council than most, they also have one of the most active and engaged cities. She wants to ensure that diversity is reflected on the Council. She stated the Board for Registration of Voters is in favor of small wards.

**7. Gauge the Sense of the Committee for: (25 min)**

**a. 8 Ward Plan Modified to Reduce Impacts to Existing Wards**

**b. 6 or 7 Ward, 13 Councilors**

**c. 4 Wards\***

**Each member will be asked to indicate if they Strongly Support, Support, are Neutral, Oppose, or Strongly Oppose each plan.**

The 8 Ward plan had 5 supporters and 9 opponents.

The 8 Ward plan created by Robert Bristow-Johnson had 6 supporters, 6 opponents, and 2 abstentions.

The 6 Ward 13 Councilor plan had 8 supporters, 5 opponents, and 1 abstention.

The 7 Ward 13 Councilor plan had 7 supporters, 5 opponents, and 2 abstentions.

The 4 Ward 12 Councilor plan had 6 supporters, 6 opponents, and 2 abstentions.

The 4 Ward 16 Councilor plan had 3 supporters, 8 opponents, and 3 abstentions.

The 7 Ward 14 Councilor plan had 4 supporters and 10 opponents.

City Council President Shannon suggested they eliminate all of the plans that were opposed more than they were supported.

Councilor Siegel stated that she feels strongly that the 13 councilor map works well numbers-wise and she does not want the New North End to have one at-large district. She prefers the 7 ward 13 councilors model.

Councilor Bushor inquired if they can see if there is agreement about deciding between the 6 or 7 ward 13 councilors model.

City Council President Shannon stated she voted in favor of 6 wards over 7 wards. She appreciates the comments about an at-large ward, but as a constituent, she would not want to have only one representative. That would make her feel that she had less representation.

Mr. Holway stated that these plans are not creating equity for people in the New North End. The Committee has decided how the New North End should be created. They have worked hard to rework the 8 ward map

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

and leave the split of the 8<sup>th</sup> ward up to the people who live there. There have been comments that they were targeting people. There are 9 people from the New North End redistricting team and they worked to look at the whole City.

Mr. Montroll inquired if the Committee does go with a 7 ward 13 councilor model, do people from the New North End have a preference between an at-large ward or two wards. Councilor Ayres stated that this is an awful choice for them either way. Having a 1 councilor ward could leave a whole portion of the City unrepresented if a Councilor were unable to serve. He would prefer the large ward, but that is not acceptable to the people of the New North End either. Councilor Decelles stated they should consider the impact to someone who is considering running. It would create a different dynamic and people would not want to run. Neither option is palatable.

Mr. Holway stated they know they want the 8 ward 16 councilor model because they did it mathematically. They would compromise with the 4 ward 16 councilor model. They would be disappointed but would take the 4 ward 12 councilor model. Each of those is about equity and would leave the entire City working under the same system.

Mr. L'Ecuyer stated there was strong opposition to the 13 councilor model at the last meeting. He believes it is in the Committee's best interest to present something that can be voted on and passed. It would be irresponsible to do otherwise.

Mr. Rooney stated those who have spoken refer to the New North End rather than Ward 4 or 7. The 6 ward plan has the New North End as a ward. That ward would have an extra Councilor that none of the other wards have. He does not see why they would get worked up over this.

Ms. Mulvaney-Stanak and City Council President Shannon made a motion to create a plan to present the four remaining plans to the Council.

City Council President Shannon stated she would prefer to eliminate more maps before presenting them to the City Council.

Mr. Holway stated he would like to narrow down the options. He does not want to say to the City Council that they could not come up with anything. They will not be able to use this.

The motion to report the four maps to the City Council failed.

City Council President Shannon suggested going through another round of voting on each of the remaining plans to see if anything has changed.

Mr. Holway stated they are rushing to judgment. He inquired if they could have another meeting when they have fresh minds. Mr. Montroll and Councilor Bushor stated they are not opposed do that.

The 8 ward 16 councilor model had 6 supporters, 6 opponents, and 2 abstentions.

The 4 Ward 12 Councilor model had 9 supporters and 5 opponents.

The 7 ward 13 councilor model had 4 supporters, 6 opponents, and 4 abstentions

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

The 6 ward 13 Councilor model had 8 supporters, 5 opponents, and 1 abstention.

City Council President Shannon and Mr. Rooney made a motion to remove the 8 ward 16 councilor model and the 7 ward 13 councilor model. Councilor Bushor requested they divide the question.

Mr. Holway stated that a tie vote sends a message. He feels that they may be able to make a few adjustments to break the tie.

The motion to eliminate the 7 ward 13 councilor model passed. The motion to eliminate the 8 ward 16 councilor model failed by a vote of 5-8.

### **8. Process for Reporting to City Council (30 min)**

Councilors Siegel and Decelles made a motion to report the three maps to the City Council and allow them to determine how to move forward.

Councilor Decelles stated he is happy they did not eliminate the 8 ward 16 councilor model. Of the maps they looked at, this was the most controversial.

Mr. Rooney stated they have wasted time if they report back three options. This group cannot come up with an answer and that is a failure.

Mr. Holway stated he feels they should come up with one map or else they will be giving an incomplete answer to the City Council.

Mr. Langan stated he disagrees. These maps are much better than the ones looked at before. Councilor Bushor agreed.

Mr. Montroll stated he believes it is worth continuing voting until they are unable to eliminate any more maps.

The motion to report three options to City Council tied by a vote of 7-7.

Councilor Bushor stated she will not be changing her vote. If this committee wants to come to one plan, they need to have another meeting. She would prefer to get feedback from the full Council with these scenarios and then they can be sent back to this committee.

Mr. Holway stated he wants to find a way to move forward in a way that is not divided. They have made progress, but they have not completed their work. He thinks they need more time.

Councilor Decelles stated the Council attempted this and felt that they failed. By forming this committee, they were able to come up with three maps that are better than what they created before this committee began their work. The City Council will not view this as a failure.

Mr. Montroll stated a committee member has left and they cannot take votes without the whole Committee present.

The City of Burlington does not discriminate on the basis of political or religious affiliation, race, color, national origin, age, sex, sexual orientation, marital status, veteran status or disability. Persons with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Clerk Treasurer's Office are encouraged to contact us at 865-7000 or 865-7142 (TTY) at least 72 hours in advance so that proper arrangements can be made.

Mr. L'Ecuyer stated he likes Councilor Bushor's suggestion. Councilor Bushor suggested sending the three maps to the Council. If they feel it is incomplete, they will send it back to Committee. She hears that people want to continue on, but perhaps the full Council will provide some insight.

Councilor Bushor and Mr. Montroll made a motion to send the three maps to Council to look at.

Mr. Holway stated they have time before they are required to report back to the Council. Ms. Cook stated the Committee was charged by reporting by the 15<sup>th</sup>.

Mr. Montroll stated they have lost a member and does not want to continue voting without the full slate. The Council can choose if they would like to reform the committee, they can. They also may provide feedback.

Councilor Decelles made a motion to call to question. The motion passed.

The motion to send three maps to the Council passed.

Ms. Nelson requested they post the three remaining maps on the City website.

Mr. Montroll stated the report should involve the entire Committee. City Council President Shannon stated the report needs to be basic. Anyone who wants to come to the meeting and speak to the Council can do so. She does not want the report to be editorial. Ms. Cook stated she will print the maps and create a summary of the vote.

## **9. Adjourn**

The meeting was adjourned at 9:44pm.